



HIGHWAYS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

18 February 2014

REPORT

Subject Heading:

**BUS STOP ACCESSIBILITY
ARDLEIGH GREEN ROAD,
ADDITIONAL PROPOSALS
Outcome of public consultation**

Report Author and contact details:

Mark Philpotts
Principal Engineer
01708 433751
mark.philpotts@havering.gov.uk

The subject matter of this report deals with the following Council Objectives

Clean, safe and green borough	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Excellence in education and learning	<input type="checkbox"/>
Opportunities for all through economic, social and cultural activity	<input type="checkbox"/>
Value and enhance the life of every individual	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
High customer satisfaction and a stable council tax	<input type="checkbox"/>

SUMMARY

This report sets out the responses to a consultation for the provision of fully accessible bus stops along Ardleigh Green Road and seeks a recommendation that the proposals be implemented (subject to the options presented).

The scheme is within **Squirrels Heath** and **Emerson Park** wards.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the Committee having considered the representations made recommends to the Cabinet Member for Community Empowerment that the bus stop accessibility improvements set out in this report and shown on the following drawings are implemented;
 - QM016-OF-202A

2. That the Committee having considered the representations made recommends to the Cabinet Member for Community Empowerment that one of the following bus stop accessibility options as set out in this report and shown on the following drawings are implemented;
 - (a) QM016-OF-205A (Option 1); or
 - (b) QM016-OF-205-2A (Option 2)

4. That it be noted that the estimated cost of £4,500 for implementation will be met by Transport for London through the 2013/14 Local Implementation Plan allocation for Bus Stop Accessibility.

REPORT DETAIL

1.0 Background

- 1.1 People with mobility problems, the elderly and people travelling with young children find it difficult to board or alight from buses, unless the vehicle is able to pull in close to the kerb (within 200mm). The difficulty of gaining kerbside access is often caused by indiscriminately parked vehicles, or lack of high kerb space adjacent to stops.
- 1.2 Improvements to the bus stop environment such as raising kerbs, relaying footway surfaces, providing short footway links to stops and (in exceptional circumstances) providing pedestrian crossing facilities can help with making bus stops fully accessible to all people. In some situations, it may be appropriate to build the footway out into the road to provide an accessible bus stop, although this will only be appropriate where carriageways are very wide.
- 1.3 The introduction of bus stop clearways improves the accessibility of bus stops by providing sufficient space for buses to pull in close to the kerb. It has become even more important with the provision of buses that are fully wheelchair accessible, because the benefits of low-floor and “kneeling” buses are considerably reduced (if not removed) if the bus cannot be positioned next to the kerb.
- 1.4 Drawing QB109/00/01B shows a standard bus stop layout where the bus stop is within a length of parked vehicles. In such a situation, a 37 metre long bus stop clearway is required to enable buses to meet the kerb so that both loading doors can be used. Where local conditions allow, this length can be reduced and so any design work will consider needs on a case by case basis.
- 1.5 In some situations, it is recognised that buses stopping on the carriageway can have an impact on traffic flows, especially on narrow roads. However, bus stops which are fully accessible to all people allow for buses to use stops more efficiently, minimising the length of time a bus is stationary. This will have the positive effect of reducing disruption to traffic flows to a minimum.
- 1.6 Where buses cannot fully access the kerb, then there may be delays in the loading or unloading of passengers leading to buses stopping longer than necessary. In some cases, certain passengers may not be able to access buses at all or the bus driver will simply need to pass the stop by where access to the kerb is not possible.
- 1.7 There are 690 bus stops in Havering. 663 are on borough roads, 20 are on the Transport for London Road Network and 7 are in private areas (e.g. Queen’s Hospital). Data as of November 2013.

- 1.8 Of these stops, 47% are deemed to be fully accessible. In order for a stop to be fully accessible, it must meet the following criteria;
- The kerb to the footway must be between 125mm and 140mm to be compatible with the front and rear loading doors of the bus and the ramp deployed from the rear loading doors;
 - The bus stop should be restricted from parking and stopping by a bus stop clearway so that the stop is always available for buses to be able to pull into tightly to the kerb.
- 1.9 For Havering, funding for Bus Stop Accessibility works has mainly come from the Transport for London Local Implementation plan (LIP), but occasionally funding is secured as part of the development process.
- 1.10 Staff from StreetCare work with TfL London Buses and the Police (where required) on a programme of mainly route-based Bus Stop Accessibility improvements, although individual sites are investigated from time to time where there are particular problems.
- 1.11 The route approach allows for comprehensive review of existing bus stop positions for accessibility, convenience, safety etc. and sometimes requires stops to be moved away from points of conflict such as where parking or proliferation of vehicle crossings prevent stops being accessible in their existing positions.
- 1.12 Proposals for accessibility improvements have been developed for various existing bus stops along Ardleigh Green Road in addition to those considered by the Committee in December 2013;

ARDLEIGH GREEN ROAD		
Drawing Reference	Location	Description of proposals
QM016-OF202A	Opposite 225 to 229	<p>37 metre bus stop clearway. 140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.</p> <p>The southern School keep clear marking to be relocated south (towards Helen Road) and reduced in length. Existing school keep clear restrictions to be amended from:</p> <p>During term time, Monday to Friday 8:15am - 9:15am & 3:00pm to 4:15pm</p> <p>To Monday to Friday 8:00am to 5:00pm</p>
<p>OPTION 1 QM016-OF-205A (northbound stop only)</p>	Outside 75 to 83	<p>Existing Location 37 metre bus stop clearway.</p>
<p>OPTION 2 QM016-OF-205/2A (northbound stop only)</p>	Outside 69 to 73	<p>Bus stop to be relocated from outside property number 81-83 to outside property number 69-73 33 metre bus stop clearway. 140mm kerb and associated footway works provided at bus boarding area.</p>

- 1.13 The proposals shown on Drawing QM016-OF-205-2A (Option 2, outside 69 to 73) were as a result of comments received in response to the proposals shown on Drawing QM016-OF-205A (Option 1, outside 75 to 83) and at the request of the committee Chairman following representations by residents. These proposals are presented as alternatives.
- 1.14 With regard to the proposals shown on Drawing QM016-OF-205A (Option 1, outside 75 to 83), approximately 10 letters were hand-delivered to those potentially affected by the scheme on or just after 25th October 2013, with a closing date of 18th November 2013 for comments.
- 1.15 With regard to the proposals shown on Drawings QM016-OF-202A (opposite 225 to 229) and QM016-OF-205-2A (Option 2, outside 69 to 73), approximately 15 letters were hand-delivered to those potentially affected by the scheme on or just after 16th December 2013, with a closing date of 6th January 2014 for comments. The adjustments to the School Keep Clear restrictions shown on Drawing QM016-OF-202A were also publicly advertised.
- 1.16 In addition, ward councillors, HAC members and standard consultees (London Buses, emergency services, interest groups etc) were sent a set of the consultation information.

2.0 Outcome of Public Consultation

- 2.1 By the close of consultation, 10 responses were received which are summarised in Appendix I (this includes one letter signed by 7 residents). The responses were all concerned with the alternatives proposed on Drawings QM016-OF-205A and QM016-OF-205-2A.

3.0 Staff Comments

- 3.1 The proposed changes shown on Drawings QM016-OF-202A (opposite 225 to 229) did not elicit any responses and so Staff recommend that the works proceed as consulted.
- 3.2 The alternative proposals set out Drawings QM016-OF-205A and QM016-OF-205-2A attracted objections to changes to the bus stop in its existing location (addition of a bus stop clearway and the rotating of the bus shelter) and relocating the stop to a position opposite Ayloffs Walk (footway works, shelter, bus stop flag and clearway)
- 3.3 Staff request that members consider the various matters raised by residents (and set out in Appendix I) in both the existing and proposed locations and recommend a treatment accordingly.

IMPLICATIONS AND RISKS

Financial implications and risks:

The estimated cost of £4,500 for implementation will be met by Transport for London through the 2013/14 Local Implementation Plan allocation for Bus Stop Accessibility. The funding will need to be spent by 31st March 2014, to ensure full access to the grant.

The costs shown are an estimate of the full costs of the scheme, should it be implemented. It should be noted that subject to the recommendations of the committee a final decision then would be made by the Lead Member – as regards actual implementation and scheme detail. Therefore, final costs are subject to change.

This is a standard project for StreetCare and there is no expectation that the works cannot be contained within the cost estimate. There is an element of contingency built into the financial estimate. In the unlikely event of an overspend, the balance would need to be contained within the overall StreetCare Capital budget.

Legal implications and risks:

Bus Stop Clearways do not require traffic orders, but Department for Transport guidance suggests that local consultations should take place.

Human Resources implications and risks:

None.

Equalities Implications and Risks:

The Council has a general duty under the Equality Act 2010 to ensure that its highway network is accessible to all users. Where infrastructure is provided or substantially upgraded, reasonable adjustments should be made to improve access. In considering the impacts and making improvements for people with protected characteristics (mainly, but not limited to disabled people, the young and older people), this will assist the Council in meeting its duty under the Act.

The provision of fully accessible bus stops assists with making public transport more inclusive to all sectors of the community, but most especially disabled people and people using pushchairs. Accessible bus stops will be of benefit to people using wheelchairs, but also people who have walking, balance and dexterity difficulties; and blind and partially-sighted people.

BACKGROUND PAPERS

Project file: QM016, Bus Stop Accessibility 2013/14

**APPENDIX I
CONSULTATION RESPONSES**

Responses	Drawing Reference & Location	Summary of Comments	Staff Comments
Respondent 1	QM016-OF-205A (Option 1, outside 75 to 83)	<p>I note that there is an intention to alter the layout of the road that will impact my property. I have grave concerns that I need to bring to your attention;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first problem is that as a resident of my property for getting on for 40 years my access is now going to be compromised so profoundly that I will be unable to leave or return to my house. You are intending to have a 24 hour curfew for any vehicle needing to park or in fact stop for any reason I understand, so how am I going to be able to stop outside of my own property? • I have electric gates to the front of my house what I had to install following a very distressing situation, where I was subjected to vandalism and criminal damage. This was extremely frightening for me. The gates do provide me with much needed security and I have to park my car outside my property to use my “key” that opens my gates and shuts them. This would seem not permissible under this proposed road changes. • I understand that you have to have the wellbeing and health and safety aspect of the bus users but I have mobility problems and I am not able to park my car over the road in another side street and walk over to my home as suggested to somebody I spoke with in your department on the phone a couple of days ago. What about my health and safety? 	<p>This is an “existing” location where the footway is accessible and in good condition. A clearway is required in order to make the stop fully accessible.</p> <p>Clearways prevent stopping or parking.</p>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The bus stop is not located in a position that appears to offer both myself and passengers easy access. In fact the bus stop has been a problem for some years since the shelter was erected. The buses stop over my drive access and it has been an ongoing problem for me as I have to wait till the bus moves for me to leave my property or access my property. There have been many times when buses have broken down across my property's access and I have been forced to remain at home unable to drive my car out or get in. It is absolutely intolerable to be told I cannot park outside my own home for any reason.• The road is in a residential area, well established over many years so it seems to me that the way of life that has been part of living in such a residence is forfeit because of a bus stop/ shelter (that is not hardly used at all, mainly only school children disembarking) that is to be changed. Where are the needs of the property owners being taken into the equation? Some of whom are also mobility challenged as I am myself.• I would also like to know if the shelter is to be reversed how close the structure will be to my boundary wall?• I have sought the help of my MP Andrew Rosindell and I have also been in conversation with Cllr Damian White who is going to visit me to discuss my concerns. My neighbours who are also affected are very upset by these proposals and like myself will be objecting strongly to the	
--	--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

		<p>road alterations.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If these alterations go ahead, needless to say the value of the properties will be seriously affected in a negative way. Obviously this is not wanted by any of the residents affected by your scheme. 	
Respondent 2	QM016-OF-205A (Option 1, outside 75 to 83)	<p>My husband and I are the current owners of 83 Ardleigh Green Road and we would wish to comments on the proposals of the above programme and particularly in relation to the sheltered stop directly outside our house. As the opportunity has arisen we would question the need for both a stop and more specifically a shelter at this stop completely for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The existing bus shelter is a current hazard as it restricts our view when exiting and entering the property. To move this around 180 degrees would not add any value to this issue. • On occasions the buses stop with their fronts directly over our driveway and we cannot see their rear as the shelter restricts view • Vehicles often drive around the stationary buses and cannot see us exiting our property which could easily cause an accident. The stand specifically makes our view of this situation difficult to read. • On the occasions where buses (or coaches) stop over our drive and other cars drive around, we have been 	<p>The rotated shelter would provided slightly better visibility emerging from driveways because the road side would be open.</p> <p>This is an “existing” location where the footway is accessible and in good condition.</p>

		<p>concerned . We have two children who walk to school exiting our house and the bus shelter restricts both their access and view as well as other drivers and this could potentially cause an accident.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would wish the council to consider moving the bus stop to a more suitable location if it is proved to be a necessary stop. As residents directly adjacent to this bus stop as a minimum, we would question the need for a large shelter. There are rarely any passengers seated there and as such a stand seems a disproportionate response especially when compared with other bus stops along the road (Ayloffs Walk and Haynes Road), that do not have shelters. <p>We would additionally strongly challenge against any move to adjust the bus stop position further closer to our driveway for the above reasons</p>	
Respondent 3	QM016-OF-205-2A (Option 2, outside 69 to 73)	<p>In regards to the proposed Bus stop accessibility plans, it seems a little strange that you intend to relocate a stop which will cause more congestion to drivers and the potential of a road hazard.</p> <p>The current proposal suggest locating the bus stop adjacent to houses 71/73, almost dead opposite Ayloffs walk junction, and less than a house width from the central crossing barriers. Cars will slow down and stop behind the bus when it is stationary. Inexperienced drivers will not pass the bus in fear of the central crossing, and any drivers trying to exit Ayloffs walk will create</p>	This location is the nearest alternative site which has sufficient high kerb and stationary buses would not overhang driveways.

		<p>further congestion. Additionally drivers trying to pass the stationary bus will try to nip into Ayloffs walk with the potential of hitting oncoming traffic.</p> <p>The sensible solution is to move the stop further down toward adjacent 65/67 away from the crossing and junction. This is a very busy road, particular during the school run.</p> <p>Further consideration needs to be given as well as a feasibility study at the busy hours.</p>	
<p>Respondent 4</p> <p>Letter also signed by 6 immediate neighbours</p>	<p>QM016-OF-205-2A (Option 2, outside 69 to 73)</p>	<p>We write collectively as the homeowners of the properties that seem to be the most affected proposals outlined in your letter of 16th December 2013 regarding access improvements for buses in Ardleigh Green Road. It came as a surprise to us that minor proposals advised to us some three months ago now appear to have been replaced by a significant change to the scheme.</p> <p>May we first state that we totally agree with the principle of improving accessibility to buses and fully support the need for such improvements. However the proposals now suggested have raised a number of serious concerns that we consider render the current proposal to be wholly unsuitable. These are:</p> <p>1) Our primary concern is a health and safety issue in that moving the existing bus stop southward to the T junction of Ardleigh Green Road and Ayloffs Walk causes an unnecessary risk of motor vehicle collisions as vehicles attempt to overtake stationary buses adjacent to this busy</p>	<p>This location is the nearest alternative site which has sufficient high kerb and stationary buses would not overhang driveways.</p>

		<p>junction.</p> <p>2) A further safety issue is that vehicles entering or exiting Ayloffs Walk will also have a restricted view particularly if there are buses stationary at both bus stops on either side of the adjacent Ardleigh Green Road.</p> <p>3) Pedestrians, including school children, will also be put at risk as the proposed new location of the bus stop on the west side of Ardleigh Green Road is within a few metres of bollards in the centre of the road which have been provided previously as a road crossing point.</p> <p>4) Traffic congestion is also likely in Ardleigh Green Road when buses are stationary as the cross hatched centre section of the road, the T junction with Ayloffs Walk and adjacent pedestrian crossing bollards will prevent ease of passing by other vehicles. This is particularly concerning in the case of the frequent emergency services vehicles needing urgent access to incidents using Ardleigh Green Road. The staggered bus stops that currently exist, approximately 100m apart, give good visibility and ease of passing.</p> <p>5) Access and egress of vehicles to each of our properties will become even more difficult than at present and could be a further safety issue when buses are stationary at the proposed new bus stop.</p> <p>6) Finally in these times of austerity we seriously question the need to fund a significantly more expensive scheme</p>	
--	--	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

		<p>to create a totally new bus stop rather than relatively minor modifications to the existing bus stop which has been in its current position for decades.</p> <p>In view of the various serious concerns regarding health and safety, restricted access and unnecessary expense outlined above, we object to this proposal in its latest form.</p>	
--	--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--